

Public Audit Report

Electronic Ticketing in Public Transport of Lithuania

30 September 2011 No. VA-P-90-1-15
Vilnius

SUMMARY

Audit started 15 October 2010
Audit completed 30 September 2011
Full [audit report](#) in Lithuanian is available
on the website of the National Audit Office

The National Audit Office performed an audit of electronic ticketing (e-ticketing) in public transport of Lithuania with a view to assess the effectiveness of the development of the e-ticketing systems.

The auditors identified failure to coordinate development of the e-ticketing systems and to control their expansion to a sufficient degree as well as to develop the e-ticket project uniformly and consistently.

Vilnius, Kaunas and Klaipėda city municipalities started uniform development of the e-ticketing systems prior to the approval of the Long-Term (until 2025) Development Strategy of the Lithuanian Transport System. From 2005, the Ministry of Transport, which was supposed to coordinate this Strategy and which planned to start introducing the e-ticketing systems interconnected with the municipal public transport e-ticketing systems from 2008, has not had a clear national vision of the electronic ticket and has failed to set the main development directions and targeted outcomes and to develop legal requirements, methodologies or recommendations ensuring operation and compatibility of such systems.

Due to delayed legal regulation of e-ticketing systems and in the absence of clear reference points, the municipalities of Vilnius, Kaunas and Klaipėda cities developed the e-ticketing systems following their own vision and observing the requirements of the agreement on the assistance of the EU Structural Funds. The amount of the EU Structural Funds, municipal funds and funds of public transport enterprises, institutions and companies already spent for the introduction and further development of the e-ticketing systems and related infrastructure in these cities during 2004-2010 totals LTL 33.87 million; however, the expected results have not been fully achieved.

It was established that the institutions which had carried out the administration of the e-ticket project and monitoring of its implementation failed to ensure suitability of the quantitative results of this project for the assessment of the project outputs. The municipalities have been conducting insufficient

control of how the outputs of the development and expansion of the e-ticketing systems are being sought and how the equipment and other informational assets of these systems are managed.

A number of shortcomings were identified in the e-ticketing systems in Vilnius, Kaunas and Klaipėda cities: the systems did not provide favourable conditions for passengers to use these systems and did not increase the number of public transport users, meanwhile the value added of the developed systems for passengers and other municipalities is low.

For the purpose of addressing the said problems, the auditors recommended the administrations of the municipalities of Vilnius, Kaunas and Klaipėda cities to draw up the final budget estimate of the development of the e-ticketing systems, to approve plans for the elimination of the existing deficiencies, and to review the strategic documents related to the expansion of the e-ticketing systems.

The cities were recommended to approve documentation on the development and safety of the e-ticketing systems, to validate the e-ticketing systems already used, to sign protocols of delivery and acceptance of all hardware and software acquired during the e-ticket project and to start using the equipment which has not been used until now or to take decisions on its further use. In addition, the administrations of the municipalities of Vilnius, Kaunas and Klaipėda cities were recommended to sign mutual agreements on compatibility of the operation of the e-ticketing systems (data exchange, safety assurance) and to provide relevant information and conditions to other municipalities so that they could use the e-ticketing systems which have already been developed, or to harmonise the existing systems with the ones already developed.

The Ministry of Transport was recommended to approve the main provisions, directions and targeted outputs of the development and expansion of e-ticketing systems, as well as the framework of the e-ticket (the concept of the e-ticket, interoperability between the systems being introduced, duties and responsibilities of institutions) in relevant strategic documents.

It should be noted that the administrations of the municipalities of Vilnius, Kaunas and Klaipėda cities managed to eliminate a number of the identified deficiencies already during the audit and certain progress in the management of the e-ticketing systems has already been achieved. Also, in July and August the Ministry of Transport submitted law amendments on clearer legal regulation of the e-ticket to the Seimas (Parliament) of the Republic of Lithuania.